DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 465 693 SO 033 894

AUTHOR Mahaffey, Cynthia Jo
TITLE Finding New Tools, Building a New House: An Introduction and Selected Bibliography of the History of Women's Rhetoric.
PUB DATE 1998-12-00
NOTE 17p.
PUB TYPE Reference Materials - Bibliographies (131)
EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS Annotated Bibliographies; *Cultural Context; *Discourse Communities; *Females; *Feminism; Historiography; Primary Sources; Social Science Research
IDENTIFIERS Public Discourse; *Rhetorical Strategies

ABSTRACT

This annotated bibliography considers the real-life outcomes of uncovering the history of women's rhetoric. By examining the public rhetoric of early U.S. female abolitionists, women's rights advocates, and suffragist proponents, the paper uses a historiographic method that considers the voices of women speaking in the public arena. The method of working through primary sources places these speeches into a cultural context in which these women rhetors thought, spoke, and wrote. It focuses on the inventive rhetorical strategies employed by women such as Maria W. Miller Stewart, Mary McClintock, Lucretia Coffin Mott, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, and Sojourner Truth. It also examines the strongly anti-patriarchal, feminist, revisionist historical method employed by and about first- and second-wave feminists such as Mary Daly, Adrienne Rich, Audre Lorde, bell hooks, Julia Kristeva, Helen Cixous, and Luce Irigaray, who use language in ways that attempts to dismantle the Master's House. The selected annotated bibliography contains sections on women's public rhetoric (nine titles); the women's literary club movement (four titles); white women's clubs (six titles); experimental women's rhetoric (five titles); history of women's rhetoric (three titles); and the rhetoric of silence in women's and Asian writing (two titles). (BT)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 465 693

# Finding New Tools, Building A New House:

## An Introduction

## And

## Selected Bibliography of the History of Women's Rhetoric

By

Cynthia Jo Mahaffey

Bowling Green State University
Bowling Green, Ohio
December 18, 1998

SO 033 894

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

C. J. Mahaffey

Finding New Tools, Building a New House:
An Introduction to a Selected Bibliography of the History
Of Women's Rhetoric

Audre Lorde's famous title, "The Master's Tools Will Never Dismantle The Master's House" has had me thinkingabout the real outcomes for me of beginning to uncover the history of women's rhetoric. Our areas of interrogation this semester—What are the possibilities of historical ınvestigation in women's rhetoric? What types of rhetorical strategies have women rhetors chosen to convey their messages, and why? How have women negotiated prevailing cultural norms—either by acceptance, mediation, refusal, or subversion—in order to find openings for their rhetorics? In what ways have the history of literacy practices in this country made greater and greater opportunities for women?—seem to me a creative set of approaches for "dismantling the Master's house." Without desiring to do damage to Lorde's effective and significant metaphor, I would like to suggest that these questions have operated and continue to operate as tools for dismantling structures which exclude women from education, literacy, self-development, and effective social action.

By attending to women's discourse and rhetoric in several distinct areas, any of which could be extended into present day theoretical work and writing practice, you have guided us, Sue, into possibilities for historical investigations for critical understanding of women's rhetoric. By examining the public rhetoric of early American women abolitionists, women's rights advocates, and suffragist proponents, I use a historiographic method that listens to the primary sources, the voices of women speaking in the public arena. The method of working through primary sources illumines, in these

speeches, the cultural context in which these women rhetors thought, spoke, and wrote. When I see these cultures, which would have prevented these women, if possible, from even speaking publicly, I am interested by the inventive rhetorical strategies employed.

Maria W. Miller Stewart engineers a rhetoric of empowerment for young black women (and men) in her use of a distinctly Afrocentric interpretation of Biblical images blended with an appeal to American nationalistic ideals. She begins with what may be acceptable to her audience—that slaves should be freed so they can be elevated to the position of servants, then pulls her hearers to a farther point, the recognition of her people's right to "want more" and to find meaningful work, as all citizens should.

Mary McClintock, Lucretia Coffin Mott, Elizabeth Cady Stanton and Martha Coffin Wright use a national document to forward their concern for a national recognition of the rights of women. As they reinscribe the Declaration of Independence, they reinscribe the possibilities for women that continue to this day to open.

Sojourner Truth, in her question, "Aren't I a woman?," references her physical body as both a disruption of cultural expectations concerning women's outward demeanor and physical performance and as an affirmation of her right to womanly choices, desires, and opportunities.

Elizabeth Cady Stanton chooses not to employ the indirect, couched agendas used by some her fellow women rhetors (a speaker like Frances E. Willard, who implemented the terms of the "cult of domesticity", for instance). Her stance is openly feminist and agonistic in approach—using male rhetoric against men, piling up sources from a wide reach, confronting the male-controlled status quo.

Encountering that wall of male control, and excluded from men's mutual improvement societies, many thousands of women chose a path which seemed directly in line with male constraints on women's lives: women's study clubs. Openly or subversively advertising as their primary concern the improvement of women for the concerns of home, wifely duties, and motherhood, the women's study clubs—particularly those of white women in the late nineteenth century—were characterized by an intense engagement in basic literacy practices, learn to read, write and discuss topics of literary or personal concern in the privacy of exclusively women's environments. Women met in each other's homes, during the day while their spouses were at work, in purposely small groups, where they could become comfortably with speaking their minds in a more private arena.

We build up this information, from historians Ann Ruggles Gere, Theodora Martin, and Annette Kolodny, with an archival approach. Historical archivists are left with certain sets of materials and draw tentative conclusions from them, knowing that many other texts, especially in the protective and guarded women's study clubs are not available, and must assume that a more accurate picture many not be possible. We know, for instance, from the collected programs and clippings of white and black women's study clubs that black clubs seem, in general, much more openly politicized and intent on social reform for black people, than do white women's clubs.

A strongly anti-patriarchal, feminist, revisionist historical method is employed by and about the experimental women's rhetoric of the 1960's,1970's and 1980's. First- and Second-Wave feminists such as Mary Daly, Adrienne Rich, Audre Lorde, bell hooks, Julia Kristeva, Helene Cixous, and Luce Irigaray use language in ways that do attempt to

"dismantle the Master's House" that is masculinist , patriarchal, and negating of the language, lives, and experience of women. The historian of this writing—and the writers themselves—work to reclaim women's language and rhetoric in revisionist ways, to rewrite the narrative, the "herstory" denied to women in the past.

Daly, in her use of feminine lore and magic ritual, and Rich, in her poetic forms, open possibilities for other, more feminine ways of seeing. Lorde calls for a recognition of the uses of masculinist language by white feminists to ignore differences among women and to oppress other women. These early experimental writers, often charged with essentialism in their approaches, are succeeded by writers like Cixous, Irigaray, Butler, and Kristeva who seek to make boundaries around feminine forms of writing more fluid and blurred, allowing for a multiplicity of entrances for readers, and for critical thought.

The work of historians like Cheryl Glenn, Jenny Redfern, and Jane Donawerth are both archival and revisionist. Reclaiming women rhetors from earlier times in history from often secondary and tertiary sources, these historians provide us—I think specifically of we women in graduate rhetoric programs and in rhetoric professorships—with foremothers, where before we had few or none. These reclamations, imbued with cultural context, careful attention to historiography, and feminist concerns, are food for our work as feminist rhetoricians in the late twentieth century.

**Finding New Tools, Building a New House:**
**A Selected Annotated Bibliography of the History of Women's Rhetoric**

By Cynthia Simpson

**Women's Public Rhetoric**

Foss, Karen A. and Sonja K. Foss. "A New Context for the Study of Women as Communicators" Re-Visioning Public Address." Women Speak: The Eloquence of Women's Lives. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, 1991.1-22.

The authors, working from the field of speech communication, disrupt foundational assumptions of that field, first by naming what is valued as "significant communication": "produced by noteworthy individuals, by historical individuals, who are male, who speak as individuals; "significant communication" occurs in the public realm and is speech-making, texts are finished products, and frameworks for assessing are derived from male perspectives" (2). Each of these assumptions is systematically interrogated, with overt goals for examining women's rhetoric as the production of "ordinary people, based on her lived experience, who [engage in] ongoing discourse…in the process of development," for foregrounding women's forms of speech, from women's perspectives, on collaborative texts, which are interpersonal and private discourse (13-14). Karen Foss and Sonja Foss argue for a feminist "reconceptualization" of women's speech, lives, and experience (21).

The following entries, arranged in chronological order, are published in:

Campbell, Karlyn Kohrs, ed. Man Cannot Speak for Her, Vol. 11: Key texts of the Early Feminists. New York: Greenwood Press. 1989.

Stewart, Maria W. Miller. "Lecture Delivered at Franklin Hall, 1832."

This, the second public speech by Stewart, is an impassioned argument against slavery, couched initially a plea for the education and training of young black women. Given before a mixed group of white and black abolitionists, Stewart uses the rhetoric of the Bible, with a particularly Afrocentric interpretation, to support her message. Stewart's employment and symbolic use of Ethiopia as the kingdom blessed by God, and the true home of the "descendants of Africa," enslaved and "free" people of color in America, foreshadows the later work of W.E.B. DuBois and Marcus Garvey. Stewart juxtaposes white slaveholders' view of people of color as "hewers and drawers of water" with the image of blacks helping win the American Revolution and surviving the "ignorance of racism" (3-8). Stewart eases the message by claiming to want only an elevation of her people to "servants," and then says people of color "want more" (7). Her argument for the gainful employment of young black men is prophetic today in its relevance.

Smith, Sarah T. "Address, Convention of Anti-Slavery Women, 1838."

Smith chooses an interesting mix of Biblical and nationalistic rhetoric in support of her argument for the end of slavery, the place of women in public dialogue (13) and for the education of black children (18). She interprets the Bible as support for the idea that women can remain true to Biblical mores and retain their intelligence. She employs quotes from male rhetors in a sarcastic and agonistic way and combines appeals for the abolition of slavery with references to the "overthrow of a system" (13). Smith then appeals to nationalistic ideals, stating that the removal of slavery is a "question of justice, humanity, morality, and religion" (12).

[Weld] Grimke, Angelina, "Address at Pennsylvania Hall, 1838."

Grimke uses the mob violence in progress outside the hall where she is speaking as vindication of her antislavery. Gathering together her audience as ones who know the truth of what should be done about slavery, she employs the image of the abolitionist as a Christ figure (26) and she, as speaker, as an "exile (29). She offers no mediation of her message—her word is "the truth" (27) and there is "no neutral ground" (30).

McClintock, Mary Ann; Lucretia Coffin Mott; Elizabeth Cady Stanton; and Martha Coffin Wright. "Declaration of Sentiments and Resolutions, 1848."

The "Declaration of Sentiments" boldly uses the language of one of the nation's "sacred texts," the Declaration of Independence, as a rhetoric for the "sacred rights" of women which had so far been denied (including some which have continued to be denied well into the end of the twentieth century). McClintock et al. call for the right of women to vote, the change laws, to receive the wages from her employment, to be financially independent of any souse, to follow public and professional careers, to attend college. To support these declarations, the authors cite British common law, upon which our Constitution was drafted. Further, the women call for a unified code of morality, and the banishment of double standard.

Stanton, Elizabeth Cady. "Speech at the Seneca Falls Convention, 1848."

Stanton's broad-ranging use of sources—international law, the various treatments of women in countries throughout the world, the Bible, even Pilgrim's Progress—builds, brick upon brick, an apologetic for women's right to vote. Men, and the masculine society which bolsters them, are "tyrannous, innocent, self-conceited, and infinitely woman's inferior in every moral quality" (47-49). Stanton anticipates the male arguments against enfranchising women—women will become unwomanly, will become warlike, will break up the unity of their households. For Stanton, these are all traps which men use to keep women enslaved. Stanton calls for the vote for women, for their voices to be heard in public arenas (as hers certainly was).

Sojourner Truth, "Speech at the Woman's Rights Convention, Akron, Ohio, 1851."

Truth uses, in a new way, the rhetoric of her body to make her argument for the rights of a woman. As she speaks, she shows her body, which defies cultural norms of softness and femininity, and continually reminds the partially hostile crowd, "And aren't I a woman?" She allows her body to speak for her womanhood and in doing so denies both the feminine cultural norm and the representation of it in real women which constrains women.

Willard, Frances E. "A White Life for Two, 1890."

Willard speaks to her conservative audiences in the terms of home, in the "cult of domesticity." Men are the "stronger sex"; women the "gentler." Therefore, women and girls deserve protection from assaults by men (something which the law at that time did not cover). Willard uses the belief, commonly held by both men and women at this time, that the home is sacred, by indirectly seeking a wide range of rights for women, all under the guise of the "sacred home." She takes one belief and stretches it to fit her agenda, coaxing her audience into following her.

Wells, Ida B. "Southern Horrors: Lynch Law in All Its Phases,1892, with Mary Church Terrell's Introduction, 1893."

Mary Church Terrell makes here an introductory speech which assumes that when whites know of the beating, lynchings, and other murders which were taking place in the South, whites would stand up and force justice to be done for southern blacks. Evidence that this was not so were the atrocities which continued (and still continue into the 1990's). The speech precedes that of Ida B. Wells, a black journalist whose presses were destroyed and her life threatened when she began crusading against lynching. Wells uses the male rhetoric of white southern news reporter as ammunition in her campaign about white attitudes. She uses their own words against them, implying that whites condemn themselves. Wells, in the manner of the reporter/editor she is, piles story of lynching upon story, until the evidence is staggering and incontrovertible. Wells advocates that black men arm themselves as the only form of protection, since the law of the land does not protect.

**The Women's Literary Club Movement**

**National Association of Colored Women's Clubs (African-American women's clubs)**

Perry, D. LaRouth. "A Sketch of Women's Clubs in Indiana." Unpublished paper for Sue Carter Simmons. Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH. n.d.

LaRouth discusses the work of Darlene Clark Hines' When the Truth is Told: A History of Black Women's Culture and Community in Indiana 1875-1950 (Indianapolis: National Council of Negro Women, Section 1C, 1981) as illustrative of how African-American women used their "legal status, social positioning, of when to organize and when to disband, and of when and how to strengthen their cases and concerns by merging with other organizations" in "contradic[tion] to stereotypical roles of women...and particularly black women" (1). Black clubwomen used their club experience to gain leadership skills, to find community outside the established church, and to work for social reforms. LaRouth's assessment of these women clarified and informed my own preliminary archival work in the Bowling Green State University on the nationally prominent black clubwoman and Toledo native Ella P. Stewart.

Roles and Achievement Committee, The Women Alive! Coalition. In Search of Our Past: Women of Northwest Ohio. Toledo: YMCA, 1987. 28-29.

Three prominent black clubwomen in northwest Ohio, Josephine St. Pierre Ruffin, Florida Ruffin Ridley, and Constance Ridley Heslip, used their positions as organizers of black women's clubs to fight lynching and argue for civil rights in the late nineteenth and early to mid-twentieth century.

Terrell, Mary Church. "What Role Is the Educated Negro Woman to Play in the Uplifting of her Race?" Ed. Beverly Washington Jones. Quest for Equality: The Life and Writings of Mary Eliza Church Terrell, 1863-1964. New York: Carlson, 1990. 151-157. (Originally published in Twentieth Century Negro Literature. Ed. D. W. Culp. Toronto: (publisher not available). 1902. 172-177.

Unlike the literary clubs of white women, African-American women's clubs of the late nineteenth century, represented on the national scale primarily by the National Association of Colored Women (of which Terrell was President for two terms), held and promoted a distinctly public and political agenda. Terrell, in her public capacity as a prominent African-American clubwoman and speaker, announces the agenda of the clubs of "her race" to be: the building of kindergartens and safe daycare for working women—an open acknowledgement of the necessity of many black women to financially support themselves and their children; the carrying on of "heart-to-heart talks" with individual clubwomen to cultivate a respectable and dignified character; the training of young women for employment as domestics; and the challenging of white women to join them in what Terrell describes as a fight against injustice. She challenges white women to teach their own children the roots and lie of prejudice, and the importance of openness to her people.

Terrell uses the rhetoric of politics also: for "colored women...the necessity of systematizing their own efforts and working on a larger scale" (151); that black clubwomen's organizations 'have done much to show our women the advantage of concerted action (151); that the women's "efforts have...been crowned with success in the twenty-six states where it has been represented (150); the use of "race" to set apart blacks from whites; showing the broad reach of clubwomen by citing national studies

(152-153); the employment of Biblical/polemical rhetoric to describe the invasive and extensive problems—"When one reflects upon the slaughter of the innocents which is occurring with pitiless persistency every day.." (153); discussion of the employment of black men as "the labor question" (155); and the use of the Declaration of Independence as the basis for remediating injustice: "…We shall protest with such force of logic and intensity of soul that those who oppress us will either cease to disavow the inalienability and inequality of human rights" (157).
(See also **Women's Public Rhetoric**)

Terrell, Mary Eliza Church. "The History of the Club Women's Movement." Ed. Beverly Washington Jones. Quest for Equality: The Life and Writings of Mary Eliza Church Terrell, 1863-1954. New York: Carlson, 1990. 315-325. (Originally published in the Aframerican Woman's Journal. Summer-Fall 1940. 34-38.

In a piece published 38 years after "What Role?", Terrell acknowledges the undeniably political purpose of the African-American clubwomen's movement by noting that organizing, on a national scale, black women who could not seek redress for injustices individually, could do so from a national group. She reprises the accomplishment of goals set in her early article, for instance, the establishment of kindergartens and nurseries, and domestic skills training for young girls (319). Her detailed history of the prominent women who lead the movement serves to place on the record these accomplishments, both for the black clubwomen, and also as a model for what she earlier designated "the dominant race."

**White Women's Clubs, Fuller's "Conversations," and Men's Self-Improvement Societies**

Gere, Anne Ruggles. "Writing Groups Outside Academic Institutions." Writing Groups History, Theory and Implications. Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1987. 32-52.

Gere examines the origins of self-help and mutual improvement societies in early America and sees in their creation a reflection of the egalitarian approach to knowledge and cooperation engendered by the nature of American history. Self and mutual education led to knowledgeable citizenship and political leadership. These groups offered members the opportunity to read and write, as well as to listen to the writing of others. The exclusion by men of women from these societies led women to form their own literary/literacy organizations.

Martin, Theodora Penny. The Sound of Our Own Voices: Women's Study Clubs 1860-1910. Boston: Beacon Press. 1987

Martin's unproblematic history of (white) women's literary clubs reveals emphases on "the Cult of Domesticity" (36)—the enclosure of women as necessary for women's protection of their families, homes, and themselves—and on club participation as a form of collaborative self-education "better suited …than…the hierarchical and adversarial

male model" (33). Literary clubs offered planned reading programs and bibliographies to fill knowledge gaps (40). Within their enclosure, meeting in members' homes and in strictly sized numbers of members, women's clubs could reflect on public issues apart from public scrutiny (49).

Gere, Ann Ruggles and Laura Jane Roop. "For Profit and Pleasure: Collaboration in Nineteenth Century Women's Literary Clubs." New Visions of Collaborative Writing. Portsmouth, NH: Boynton/Cook Publishers, 1992.1-18.

In their examination of two early women's literary clubs, Gere and Roop show how these "women-only" sites gave women space for literacy acquisition, community, varied means of collaboration—both within their clubs' current texts and archives and in each others' presence—and measures of personal freedom not found within the contexts of their individual lives.

Gere, Ann Ruggles. "Common Properties of Pleasure: Texts in Nineteenth Century Women's Clubs." The Construction of Authorship: Textual Appropriation in Law and Literature. Eds. Martha Woodmansee and Peter Jaszi. Chapel Hill: Duke University Press, 1994. 383-400.

Viewing the literacy and social activities of women in literary clubs in the latter part of the nineteenth century as a rejection of current male practices of the "concepts of intellectual property...and authorship," Gere posits the presence of an early "feminism"—albeit a stance purposely removed from political efforts like suffragism-- in these sites. These feminine/ist practices included self-education, collaborative authorship, production, and use of the texts, sharing the texts as an egalitarian/economic sharing, and interaction with texts with pleasure as its end, within the safety of the club environment. In public, these activities were performed as ways for women to improve themselves as "womanly women," centered around their care of husbands, children, and home. The difference between the private performance and external appearance of these women's clubs is evidence, for example, by the members' "parodies...of texts produced by the dominant culture" (395).

Kolodny, Annette. "Inventing a Feminist Discourse: Rhetoric and Resistance in Margaret Fuller's Woman in the Nineteenth Century." Reclaiming Rhetorica: Women in the Rhetorical Tradition. Ed. Andrea A. Lunsford. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1995. 137-166.

Kolodny examines the teaching and writing of Margaret Fuller, proposing Fuller's Woman in the Nineteenth Century as a model of early feminist discourse. "Feminist discourse," for the author, includes the adaptation of familiar (to the time) sources for teaching rhetoric to young male students for use with young female students. Another element in Fuller's teaching was the refusal to decide for her adult women students when

their "Conversation" was closed. The discussion and her writing about it were ongoing, and employed a variety of rhetorical strategies, including treatises which drew upon the intertextuality of the women's discussions:

> Instead of relegating the conversation to an exclusively oral exercise, Fuller would simulate its components in a written treatise. In so doing, she chose her rhetorical devices carefully, emulating the female antislavery lecturers by bringing her subject into "home relations" and by eschewing "combativeness."

In thinking about Fuller's use of these strategies what might first appear to be an attempt on Fuller's part to support, in Carol Gilligan's words, the "socially constructed feminine voice" of the time, may actually represent an extremely subversive method for enabling women students to use the socially acceptable women's voice to critically examine issues important to these women.

Gere, Anne Ruggles. Intimate Practices: Literacy and Cultural Work in U. S. Women's Clubs, 1880-1920. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1997.

Gere foregrounds issues of race, class, nationalism, and cultural norms in her discussion of women's literary clubs. These issues are framed from a social/material approach to clubwomen's literacy practices—women's clubs were "alternative spheres" where women could read, write and be connected to others, through conversation and co-authorship of texts (21). Women "shared critiques of the dominant culture", believed that "their own production and consumption of texts could change their material circumstances" (21). Clubwomen shaped their texts and their sense of who they were as women according to their "specific racial, religious or class positions" and refused to acccept others' stories of them.

**Experimental Women's Rhetoric**

Daly, Mary. "Preliminary Web One: "The Wickedary: Its History/Metamystery," (originally published in Gyn/Ecology, 1978), in Listening to Their Voices: The Rhetorical Activities of Historical Women, Ed. Molly Meijer Wertheimer. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1997.

Daly's work with a style that includes new spellings and combined old words for the production of fresh meaning is a resistance and a refusal of what Daly perceives as foundational, linguistic, patriarchal and masculinist infections of language. Daly operates within a sphere of feminine/ist myth, lore, and spirituality to disenfranchise male language, and thus, his power. Her agenda is women's empowerment through a new, feminine language, through interconnection with women, through honoring feminine power, wisdom. Like Rich, Daly sees this work of women as a living in the "borders."

Lorde, Audre. "The Master's Tools Will Never Dismantle the Master's House." Comments at "The Personal and Political Panel," Second Sex Conference, New York, Sept. 29, 1979. In Ada Gray Griffin and Michelle Parkerson's film, A

Litany for Survival: The Life and Work of Audre Lorde. New York: Third World Newsreel, 1996.

Lorde insists that white feminists do not accomplish what feminist work ought to because they do not acknowledge the real effects of sexual, gender, class and racial differences among women, and thus are complicit in the patriarchal constraints on women's ability to create personal/political/social transformation. White femininists, representing feminism univocally, become part of women's oppression.

Bridwell-Bowles, Lillian. "Discourse and Diversity: Experimental Writing Within the Academy. College Composition and Communication 43:3 (October 1992). 349-368.

In making her case for "new forms of discourse, new kinds of academic essays," Bridwell-Bowles foregrounds both her ideology and a broad-based ethos:

> If we are to invent a truly pluralistic society, we must envision a socially and politically situated view of language and the creation of texts—one that takes into account gender, race, class sexual preference, and a host of other issues that are implied by these and other cultural differences (349).

For Bridwell-Bowles, the "creation of texts" occurs when we teach students "ways to critique not only their material and their potential readers' needs, but also the rhetorical conventions that they are expected to employ in the academy" (349). She critiques the refusal of first-year composition and writing-across-the-curriculum programs to develop new and "transformative" literacy strategies (349).

While students may, as she point out, need to draw on "standard conventions before they can challenge or criticize them" (350), teachers should provide writing strategies "outside the dominant discourse" (350). These strategies will help students develop "linguistic and rhetorical flexibility [which] may help [them] write better conventional prose" (351). Bridwell-Bowles provides professional examples of "diverse discourse" in these modes:

1. "personal narrative/emotional writing"—e.g. Elizabeth Tompkins
2. "breaking the boundaries of textual space"—e.g. Judy Chicago
3. "language play"—e.g. Helene Cixous, Luce Irigaray, Julia Kristeva, Mary Daly
4. "not the mythic white women"—e.g. bell hooks, Moi
5. "breaking out of linguistic prejudice"—e.g. Audre Lorde, Gloria Anazualda
6. "class barriers"—e.g. Mike Rose
7. "sexual orientation"—e.g. Mark Lilly [and Harriet Malinowitz]
8. "differing composing processes"—e.g. Ede and Lunsford
9. "the invigorating search for materials"—Bridwell-Bowles' own search for "analyses of race, gender, language and sexual preference....which allow possibilities for all writers who want to create their own divergent, alternative discourses" (361).

Bridwell-Bowles uses samples from student writing in her own classes to illustrate experimental forms her students have chosen:

1. use of the "personal voice in academic writing"

2. honoring "reader-based" over "writer-based" prose as a means of working through thinking about academic issues
3. "writing without an argument"
4. multivocal textual presentation
5. collaborative writing (361-365).

(I include the Bridwell-Bowles entry as an illustration of how one author envisions pedagogical uses of experimental writing.)

Covino, William A. "Grimoires and Witches." Magic, Rhetoric and Literacy: An Eccentric History of the Composing Imagination. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1994. 117-170.

(I want to concentrate here only on Covino's assessment of Mary Daly's work). Covino is clearly antagonistic to Daly's subversion of what she views as patriarchal language for the use of women's empowerment. Pronounced exclusivistic and generalized in its' charge of patriarchy, Daly's work is dismissed as "universal love/we're-all-alike-on-the-inside sentiments" (144). It seems that this is exactly what Daly is **not**, and Covino himself helps prove this by his masculinist exposition of Daly's uses of feminine lore and language. Daly's assertion that changing language is crucial to empowering women is also dismissed as a "too glib association of transformative language and magical power" (151). Finally, Covino finds that Daly's linguistic forms exclude, not only men, but also women and is, at bottom, "simplistic…and dangerous" (150).

Ratcliffe, Krista. "Re-Visioning the Borderlands: Adrienne Rich." Anglo-American Feminist Challenges to the Rhetorical Traditions: Virginia Woolf, Mary Daly, Adrienne Rich. Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press. 1996. 107-140.

Ratcliffe examines Adrienne Rich's stance, in Ratcliffe's words, that "language use and language function are gendered; as such, language plays an integral role in constructing women's subjectivity" (107). Writing, traditionally masculinist, negates the experience and language of women, according to Rich. Ratcliffe positions Rich as a "rhetorical theorist" (108) in her use of poetry as a written form which is outside the sphere of masculinist writing, and, which is, therefore, clearly more available and enabling to women. Rich's use of the word *women* is interrogated as an opening to her social/political feminist concerns.

Ratcliffe uses "Rich's dream of a common language" to examine patriarchal social constructions of women and of gender which constrain women, which show how "women and men occupy different symbolic positions" (119). Rich occupies, for Ratcliffe, a "marginalized, border position" (120)—a position which women have long occupied. Ratcliffe argues, with Rich, that using this border position can empower women to develop "self" and her own voice.

**History of Women's Rhetoric**

Redfern, Jenny R. "Christine de Pisan and *The Treasure of the City of Ladies*: A Medieval Rhetorician and Her Rhetoric." Ed. Andrea Lunsford. Reclaiming Rhetorica: Women in the Rhetorical Tradition. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1995. 73-92.

Redfern foregrounds de Pisan's importance as a rhetorician through a discussion of her "manners book." Her *Treasure of Ladies*, though part of a long tradition of books which were meant to teach women how to behave (and survive) in the patriarchal society in which they lived, sought also to teach women how to educate themselves. Self-education by women would, in Redfern's words, "increase respect for the image of womanhood and for individual women within the existing social order" (76). De Pisan used the tools of rhetoric to change medieval attitudes toward women "that would be acceptable to both male and female audiences" and carve out an increased space for women's strengths within moral and public spheres.

Donawerth, Jane. ""As Becomes a Rational Woman to Speak": Madeleine's de Scudery's Rhetoric of Conversation." Listening to Their Voices: The Rhetorical Activities of Historical Women. Ed. Molly Meijer Wertheimer. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1997. 305-319.

Donawerth builds the case that Scudery, a seventeenth-century novelist, "revisioned the tradition of masculine "public" discourse for mixed gender "private" discourse in salon society, emphasizing conversation and letter-writing" (305). In doing so, Scudery stepped out of current gender roles (307), created a feminine discourse fundamentally different than traditional male rhetoric (307), and offered women, through education, social mobility. Scudery employs letter-writing, in Donawerth's view, to "blur…the line between private and public spheres, and so provide women letter writers with a rhetorical space in which to exercise their influence" (312).

Glenn, Cheryl. "Locating Aspasia on the Rhetorical Map." Listening to Their Voices: The Rhetorical Activities of Historical Women. Ed. Molly Meijer Wertheimer. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1997.19-41.

Glenn recovers Aspasia, philosopher, rhetorician, wife of Pericles, through secondary sources such as Plutarch, Isocrates, Philostratus, Xenophon, and Plato, and uses these sources to construct a "text" of her work. Glenn shows how Aspasia's atypical use of her education, her social position as a woman and as the wife of a prominent politician and rhetorician makes room for the place of women in a traditional, masculinist, and exclusionary rhetorical history.

**The Rhetoric of Silence in Women's and Asian Writing**

Oliver, Robert T. "Culture and Rhetoric." Rhetoric: Concepts, Definitions, and Boundaries. Eds. William Covino and David Jolliffe. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1995. 353-363.

Oliver exposes the myths concerning Asian uses of silence by comparing Western and Eastern understanding of communication rituals and modes, and by noting the ways in which Western speech communication theories, applied to Eastern rhetoric, have resulted in misconceptions about Eastern modes of speech and writing. Using a sociological/anthropological methodology (354), Oliver illustrates the importance of "their manner of talk", the politeness rituals which are crucial to how Asians use language, and the Asian understanding of cultural differences and context (355). Oliver notes that silence is a key and positive element in Asian rhetoric.

Saneholtz, Elizabeth. "Women and Silence." Silence as a Potentially Positive Rhetorical Strategy: Exploring Examples from Women's Writing and Chinese Rhetoric. M.A. Diss. Bowling Green State University, 1997.

In an examination of the uses of silence in literature by women, and by women in their lives, Saneholtz constructs a careful critique of the negative uses of silence by women, the ways women have been silenced by those "constraining their access to public spheres" (7), and argues for the possibilities of silence as a set of useful rhetorical strategies. In contradiction to a prevalent feminist view that silence is oppressive (12), Saneholts compiles a history of ways women have used silence to release themselves from oppression.